

Mr. Noel O Keeffe  
County Engineer and Director of Water Services

CC: Mr. Martin Riordan  
County Manager

**Re: Fluoridation of Public Drinking Water Supplies and Report on Human Toxicity, Environmental impact and Legal Implications on Water Fluoridation**

13th April 2012

Dear Mr. Noel O Keeffe

Thank you for your letter of 12th April regarding my correspondence and scientific report on *Human Toxicity, Environmental Impacts and Legal Implications of Water Fluoridation*.

As I have noted in my report, it is acknowledged that there is a legal requirement for Local Authorities to fluoridate drinking water supplies as provided by the Health (Fluoridation of Water Supplies) Act, 1960.

There is also as noted in my report a legal requirement to undertake an environmental impact assessment of such operations. To my knowledge no such studies have ever been undertaken in Ireland.

Can you advise if Cork County Council as the largest local authority in Ireland have undertaken any environmental impact assessment examining the ecological impacts of anthropogenic fluoride emissions from waste water treatment plants on freshwater and terrestrial ecosystems? Failure to have undertaken such an assessment is a violation of EU Law.

It is widely acknowledged and accepted by the scientific community that fluoride emissions are harmful to aquatic freshwater ecosystems at low concentrations and fluoride concentrations in sewage sludge disposed of on land as a biosolid is now regarded as critical priority pollutant due to fluoride contamination and its potential human impact due to contamination of the human food chain.

The Council as the statutory water authority have a legal requirement to ensure that the management of water services complies with all relevant EU legislation and not just the Irish Water Fluoridation Regulations, which as you are aware predate Ireland joining the EU.

In the context of existing EU and national regulatory legislative policy concerning the environment, health and food, it has been found that the policy of water fluoridation contravenes thirteen EU Directives, three EU Food Regulations, four Statutory Regulatory Instruments, one EU Medical Directive, one EU Product Directive, seven international Treaties, three European Conventions and six European Action Policies totalling thirty-eight separate acts of legislation. Can you advise what the Councils

position is in regard to violation of these particular Directives? Does failure to comply with these Laws justify continuing to enforce the Regulation on Water Fluoridation alone?

You may not be aware but recently the Health Minister in Chile ordered the cessation of further water fluoridation in Chile until a comprehensive environmental impact assessment was undertaken to demonstrate that such a policy would not impact on their inland waterways and ecosystems. This example is given as no other European Member State supports a policy enforcing systemic fluoridation of public water supplies. There are no EU Directives in support of water fluoridation and it is not a policy supported by the European Commission. Notwithstanding this the EU's most recent study found that the topical application of fluoride via toothpaste was the most effective method to control dental caries and not the systemic fluoridation of public drinking water supplies. The Commission also advised that inadequate toxicological information was currently available on the silicofluoride chemicals used for water fluoridation, a matter that was also highlighted by the National Academy of Sciences in the U.S.A. In total over fifty detailed epidemiological, toxicology, clinical medicine and environmental exposure assessments were identified to be undertaken in order to fill data gaps in the hazard profile, the health effects and the exposure assessment of fluoride via water fluoridation. Alarming not one of these studies has been undertaken by the Regulatory Authorities in Ireland.

From an environmental management perspective the current policy is one of the most environmentally unsustainable policies ever developed given that 99.5% of fluoridated water is not used for the purpose it was intended and ends up as a persistent contaminant in the natural environment. Fluoridated water is used for flushing toilets, car washing, clothes washing, it is used unnecessarily by fire departments, industry and food producers. It is now known that fluoridated water at the optimum levels applied in Ireland contaminates baby food at levels that are now known to be harmful to their health and in violation of National and European Food Laws.

I would welcome the views of Cork County Council regarding these important matters.

I have as you are aware from my previous correspondence requested of Cork County Council as well as the Department of Environment that documentary evidence is provided to Local Authorities to demonstrate that the silicofluoride chemical, which is added to drinking water supplies in Ireland, has been tested in accordance with all EU Legal requirements. This includes as outlined in my report the European Council Medicinal Products Directive 2004/27/EC, the European Council Cosmetic Products Directive 76/768/EEC, the European Council Infant Formulae Regulations S.I. No. 243/1998, the European Council Food Hygiene Legislation (178/2002) and the European Council Foodstuffs Regulation (EC) 852/2004.

In addition that the HSE provide documentary evidence that the Regulation complies with all relevant environmental legislation including the; European Council Water Framework Directive, the European Council Dangerous Substances Directive (80/68/EEC), European Council Groundwater Directive (2006/118/EC), European Council Drinking Water Directive (98/83/EEC), European Council Urban Wastewater Treatment Directive(91/271/EEC), European Council Fresh Water Fish Directive

(2006/44/EEC), European Council Habitats Directive (92/43/EEC), European Council Impact Assessment Directive (85/337/EEC), European Council Marine Strategy Framework Directive 2008/56/EC, European Council Common Fisheries Policy (2371/2002), European Council Habitats Directive (92/43/EEC), European Council Dangerous Substances Directive (2006/11/EC), European Council Environmental Liability Directive (2004/35/CE), Urban Waste Water Treatment Regulations, S.I. No. 254/2001, Water Quality (Dangerous Substances) Regulations (S.I. No. 12 /2001), Local Government (Water Pollution) Regulations (SI No.271/1992) and the Fisheries (Consolidation) Act, of 1959.

Without this burden of proof, enforcement of the Water Fluoridation Regulatory Act is itself illegal.

I would ask that the Council request this information to be provided to protect the Council from any future potential legal liabilities.

Your's sincerely



Declan Waugh

EnviroManagement Services  
Risk Management, Environmental Auditor and Environmental Consultant